

Challenges Faced by Islamic Organizations in Promoting Sustainability: a case study of islamic union student association (Hima Persis)

Aldi Surizkika^{a,*} & Ihsan Abdul Haq^b

^aInstitut Agama Islam Sahid Bogor, Jl. Kapten Dasuki Bakri, Kec. Pamijahan, Bogor, Jawa Barat 16810, Indonesia

^bUniversitas Islam Jakarta, Kota Jakarta Timur, Daerah Khusus Ibukota Jakarta, 13120, Indonesia

Abstract

This study examines the challenges faced by the Islamic Unity Student Association (HIMA PERSIS) in promoting sustainability and intellectual development within Islamic organizations in Indonesia. The research employs qualitative methodology through literature study analysis of primary sources about HIMA PERSIS and secondary sources about related organizations. The results reveal four major challenges: the dichotomy between religious and worldly knowledge, contradictions between service and cadre welfare in research activities, internal feudalism as a crisis obstacle, and the impact of stigma and stereotypes on collaboration and innovation. The findings suggest that HIMA PERSIS faces significant organizational coordination issues, resource limitations, and struggles in balancing traditional Islamic values with modern academic demands, while its implementation of the *ulul albab* concept remains underdeveloped within the organization's framework.

Keywords: Hima Persis; sustainability; organizational challenges; Islamic education; intellectual development.

1. Introduction

The Islamic Unity Student Association (Hima Persis) operates as an autonomous entity within the framework of the Islamic Unity (Persis). HIMA PERSIS is one of the extra-campus organizations that is still active today, and is able to compete with other well-known organizations such as PMII and HMI. HIMA PERSIS has a philosophy that is in line with the *ulu al-bāb* movement, which is characterized by its "scientific", "progressive", and "revolutionary" focus. This philosophy is articulated through three interconnected concepts that are the foundation of the trias politica: intellectualism, social transformation, and changing the political climate (Muttaqien, 2021; Persis & Nomor, 2020).

A challenge faced by HIMA PERSIS in utilizing intellectuality for social change is the response that a strong commitment to traditional religious practices in certain communities takes precedence over the integration of scientific understanding. It is worth considering that some HIMA PERSIS members may perceive a focus on intellectual pursuits as incompatible with their spiritual goals. In addition, the complexity of secular scientific research has the potential to undermine values and beliefs that are fundamental to Islamic teachings.

Furthermore, it is important to realize that HIMA PERSIS faces very complex challenges, which are rooted in its internal dynamics as well as its interactions with other autonomous organizations such as Persis, Persistri, Pemuda and Pemudi. This is particularly ironic given the reality of friction in their thought processes, which can lead to misunderstanding and conflict. Such friction is often exacerbated by persistent negative stereotypes and stigmas, which unfortunately hinder intellectual movement within HIMA PERSIS. This internal strife not only hinders collaboration, but also stifles innovative thinking and progress. Therefore, it is imperative for the organization to address these issues and strive to create a more cohesive and supportive environment conducive to intellectual development.

This challenge has the potential to drive significant social, economic and political change. Conversely, it can be a mere illusion. At the core of sustainable progress is intellectual development, which is the most essential element of growth and transformation. Undermining or deconstructing this basic aspect commonly referred to as "tarbiyyah,"

* Corresponding author.

E-mail address: a.surizkika97@gmail.com

which includes education and moral development poses a risk to the essence of holistic progress. To erode such an essential component of development is to unravel the fabric of progress itself, which will ultimately lead to stagnation rather than meaningful change. Therefore, preserving and encouraging intellectual development is critical to fostering genuine and lasting transformation in all aspects of society.

2. Literature Review

HIMA PERSIS is an external student organization under Persatuan Islam, aimed at transforming ideas within campuses and developing intellectual products to support future struggles of Persis. The organization adopts the concept of Ulul Albab as its philosophy and guiding principle in its activities. The research concludes that the understanding of Ulul Albab among HIMA PERSIS cadres at STAI Persis Bandung is not yet fully developed, and their implementation does not reflect the characteristics of Ulul Albab (Muttaqien, 2021).

Next study examines the role of youth organizations in Indonesia, particularly focusing on Pimpinan Wilayah HIMA PERSIS Jawa Barat, in political socialization for the upcoming 2024 elections. The findings highlight that the organization aims to educate and prepare its members and the public for political engagement, ensuring stability and addressing political issues (Setia, 2023). More study examines the kaderisasi (cadre formation) patterns within the Persatuan Islam (PERSIS) organization, focusing on both historical and contemporary contexts. Initially, kaderisasi was cultural and occurred naturally through teacher-student relationships. Over time, the process became more structured, utilizing formal (PERSIS pesantren) and non-formal educational media (muballigh courses). The institutionalization of kaderisasi is outlined in PERSIS's Qanun and guidelines. The study highlights that the current kaderisasi system is not comprehensive or integrated, recommending a more holistic approach for all stakeholders (Fauzan et al., 2020).

3. Research Method

This research employs a qualitative methodology with a comprehensive literature study design focusing on the Islamic Unity Student Association (HIMA PERSIS) in Indonesia. The primary data sources consist of official organizational documents, including the organization's constitution, policy papers, meeting minutes, and published reports directly related to Hima Persis' activities and development. Secondary sources encompass a wide range of academic literature, including peer-reviewed journal articles, books, conference proceedings, and research papers that discuss organizational development, Islamic student movements, and religious organizations in Indonesia. The data analysis process involves systematic content analysis, thematic coding, and interpretative analysis to identify patterns, challenges, and developmental trends within the organization. This methodological approach allows for a thorough examination of both historical and contemporary aspects of HIMA PERSIS' organizational dynamics, while also considering the broader context of Islamic organizational development in Indonesia's educational landscape.

4. Results and Discussions

4.1. *Reconstructing the Paradigm of ulul albab in the Frame of Intellectuality: The Dichotomy Of Religious And Worldly Knowledge*

Dichotomy in science is a paradigm that is often discussed endlessly. The existence of this separation has an impact on the division of education models. On the one hand, there is education that only emphasizes modern science without regard to religious values, while on the other hand there is education that only focuses on religion, separated from the development of science. Theoretically, dichotomy means a clear separation between two different types, where they cannot be included in each other. Thus, dichotomy describes the separation of science into two parts that have different directions and meanings without any common ground between them. From an Islamic perspective, this view is very different, because Islam sees science as something whole and universal without any separation or dichotomy (Poerbakawaja, 1982).

One of the efforts to overcome this situation is to integrate these two sciences, namely religious and general sciences. This effort is needed if we do not want a situation that will jeopardize the future of humanity (Murjazin et al., 2023). Allah created reason for mankind in order to understand and analyze nature as a guide in living the life of the world. This is reflected in His words in Surah Ali Imran verse 190: Meaning: *Surely in the creation of the heavens and the earth, and the alternation of night and day, there are signs for those who understand.*

Today, many scientists tend to separate religious and worldly sciences, so this prompted Naquib Al-Attas and Ismail Raji Al-Faruqi to introduce the concept of Islamization of science. Their disappointment as Muslim intellectuals with the education system in the Islamic world, which adopts educational dualism, encouraged them to fight for this. This educational dualism arises because of the decline of Muslims in various fields, along with the advancement of Western science that controls many fields and tries to unravel the mysteries of the universe (Effendy & Ali, 1986). Ismail Raji Al-Faruqi states that the decline of Muslims puts them in the lowest position among nations. In addition, Al-Faruqi also argues that science cannot be separated from values, and what needs to be Islamized is not the people, but the science. The purpose of the Islamization of science is so that people who study science can be directly affected by the mindset and behavior in accordance with Islamic teachings. To this end, Al-Faruqi suggests three steps: first, making the Qur'an and sunnah the basis of thinking; second, studying modern science; and third, applying a philosophical approach to science (Al-Faruqi, 2012, 2013).

However, under these conditions, Muslim societies view Western progress with admiration, which encourages them to emulate Western culture through the process of westernization. Unfortunately, this westernization actually distances Muslims from the teachings of the Qur'an and hadith. Muslims are caught in a dilemma, wanting to progress by imitating the rapidly developing Western culture, but in the end they fall into destruction because they are unable to filter the values they receive. The author analyzes that this happens because Muslims do not have a strong grip. Westernization has obscured their basic principles, namely the Qur'an and sunnah, so that Muslims are trapped in their confusion and divided between Islamic traditions and Western values, which ultimately led to a decline in Islamic civilization.

4.2. HIMA PERSIS and Research : The Contradiction Between Service And Cadre Welfare In Organizations

Research is an essential element in the development of knowledge and the advancement of an organization. Organizations, be it in the education, social, or economic sectors, often rely on research to gain a deeper understanding of the issues at hand and to come up with workable solutions. However, while research has great potential to drive organizational progress, the reality is that it is often costly. On the other hand, many organizations and individuals involved in such research face dilemmas regarding their welfare, particularly the hard-working cadres in the field (Davenport & Prusak, 1998; Whitley, 2000).

It is important to understand that research is not a cheap process. From planning, to data collection, to analysis and publication, it requires a lot of money. In many cases, research funding is limited, whether it comes from internal organizations or external sponsors. Researchers often have to work with limited resources, which leads to sacrifices, both in terms of time and finances. The cadres involved in such research often have to sacrifice their personal well-being, as the income they receive is not commensurate with the workload and responsibilities they carry. On the other hand, most organizations that rely on research results are often unable or unwilling to provide adequate rewards for the cadres involved. These cadres, who often consist of students, volunteers, or low-paid staff, often work with a motivation of devotion and high dedication to the organization's goals. However, while they work hard to produce research results that can benefit or positively impact the organization, their welfare often does not receive comparable attention (Jain & Triandis, 1997).

This contradiction between service and welfare creates significant tension in many organizations. On the one hand, the organization expects the cadres to work with a high spirit of dedication, in the hope that the research results can have a major positive impact. On the other hand, the cadres, as individuals, have basic needs that must be met, including economic needs for daily life. Without adequate support in terms of welfare, it is not uncommon for the spirit of dedication to decline over time. This can lead to low productivity or even resignation of cadres who feel that their service is not properly appreciated (Willmott, 1993). Ideally, organizations need to find a balance between properly rewarding cadres involved in research and ensuring that research results can be used for the betterment of the organization. One way to address this issue is to ensure adequate funding for research, as well as providing incentives that can improve the welfare of the cadres involved. Such incentives do not necessarily have to be monetary, but can also take the form of awards, opportunities for career development, or even recognition of their contributions in the form of publications or participation in seminars and conferences (El Widdah, 2022).

In addition, organizations also need to see research as a long-term investment that not only benefits the organization in terms of scientific development, but also provides direct benefits to the cadres involved. Successful research can enhance the reputation of the organization, which in turn can attract more resources and financial support, which will ultimately provide greater benefits to the well-being of the cadres. Ultimately, the issue of the contradiction between service and welfare in research is not just a financial one, but also touches on basic values in an organization, such as

fairness, recognition, and responsibility towards members. An organization that cares about the welfare of its members, especially those involved in research, will create a more productive and innovative environment. This will lead to better quality research results that can provide greater benefits, not only to the organization but also to society as a whole (Shediak-Rizkallah & Bone, 1998).

Given the importance of research in the development of organizations and societies, it is high time that we take the welfare of the cadres involved more seriously. Without adequate welfare, the spirit to innovate and serve will be reduced, which in turn can hinder the progress of the organization and the expected research results.

4.3. Internal feudalism is a crisis obstacle for HIMA PERSIS

Feudalism in the internal structure of Persis is a significant obstacle to the development and progress of Hima Persis. The hierarchical system of power among some of Persis' structural elites creates conflicts and inefficiencies that hinder the organization's ability to unite and develop. As a result, socio-economic challenges arising from feudal practices stifle innovation and hinder progress within Hima Persis, making it difficult for the region to overcome the current crisis.

Feudalism, as a historical and organizational concept, refers to a system in which political, military, social, and economic power is delegated from a central authority, such as a king or lord, to vassals. This system was prevalent in medieval Europe and was characterized by vassalage, homage, and land grants. The organization of feudal societies was complex, involving hierarchical structures that affected various aspects of life, including economic activities and social relations. The concept of feudalism has also been applied metaphorically to describe certain modern organizational structures, such as intra-company hierarchies and virtual organizations.

In this context the relationship between feudalism, organization and religious authority becomes a complex topic that can be explored. Feudalism, as a historical system, involves hierarchical structures of power and land ownership, which can be compared to the organizational structures found in religious institutions. Meanwhile, religious authority often intersects with these organizational structures, influencing governance and social order. This relationship is evident in both historical and modern contexts, where religious organizations often mirror feudal systems in their hierarchical nature.

Critics of the approach taken by the New Institutional Economics point out that while it is methodologically inappropriate to start a comparative discussion of institutions from the premise of failure or success, efficiency vs. inefficiency, the idea that there are patterns in different institutional configurations in the East and West still holds. Every definition of institutions considers them as structures or processes carried out by social order. However, these regularities do not simply flow from the addition of individual rational behavior. They are the result of power struggles among various actors that shape institutions as arenas of social conflict and strife. This was perfectly explained by Michel Foucault more than thirty years ago when he suggested "that one should analyze institutions from the point of view of power relations, not the other way around, and that the basic point of those relations, though embodied and crystallized in an institution, can be found outside the institution" (Foucault, 1982).

However, such an analysis requires a clear identification of what we actually mean when we refer to "institutions". In this regard, eclecticism is always a methodological advantage. This is why Jacques Revel's distinction between three different meanings of institution is so useful: I) The more technical and limited meaning, prevalent in legal history, regards institutions as "legal-political entities". II) The broader view includes any organization, which works regularly in society according to implicit and explicit rules, and responds to specific collective demands (family, school, trade union). III) A very broad usage refers to any form of social organization that incorporates values, rules, or models of relationships or behavior based on mutual expectations (Humfress, 2014; Scott, 2008).

As Gadi Algazi has noted, historians tend to feel more comfortable with a narrower understanding of what an institution is, whereas for comparative purposes "we may find ourselves using the same term to refer to phenomena that may be related but remain very different". This is of course a serious problem. And the methodological answer to such a problem, as Algazi also points out, can only be pragmatic: to change definitions at will and, in particular, to describe the formation or behavior of institutions in terms of social processes. Following this approach, a fruitful discussion of institutions would not treat them as established, essential entities, but rather as processes of institutionalization in which "most of these processes occur ex post facto, as messy past realities are given new meanings, as improvised practices are formalized and regulated, in ways that may not be possible in their actual and contingent contexts". This is crucial. The following discussion attempts to uncover how conflicted institutional

formation shapes norms and practices derived from power relations. By focusing on the performative aspects of this process, I will try to identify the limits created by the social order that lies behind institutions (Algazi, 2014).

4.4. Stigma and stereotypes are barriers to aspects of collaboration in driving innovation and change

The existence of stigma and stereotypes pose significant barriers to effective collaboration between HIMA PERSIS and various internal autonomous bodies. These assumptions create a barrier that hinders the exchange of ideas and the development of an innovative environment. To foster meaningful change and encourage innovation, it is imperative to address and dispel these misconceptions. By fostering a culture of openness and mutual understanding, both HIMA PERSIS and its internal partners can work together more effectively, utilizing their unique strengths and perspectives to create a more dynamic and collaborative atmosphere.

The current leadership of HIMA PERSIS has the potential and intelligence to capitalize on opportunities and encourage inclusivity in collaborating with various stakeholders. By embracing a more cooperative approach, they can increase engagement and support within the organization. However, instead of receiving the expected appreciation for these collaborative efforts, the initiative is considered a misstep. Critics argued that it undermined Persis' core values and organizational spirit, leading to a broader discussion on the need for alignment between goals and practices within the organization (Usman, 2021). This situation highlights the complexity of navigating relationships with stakeholders and the importance of maintaining a strong organizational identity while pursuing collaborative ventures (Gruenewald, 2004).

Unfortunately, the collaborative efforts initiated by HIMA PERSIS in partnership with various stakeholders have not sufficiently prioritized the allocation of grants for the research sector. This omission is particularly concerning, as strong research initiatives are crucial to enhancing the intellectual development of its cadres, which is a fundamental aspect of the organization's mission. This creates a glaring paradox for HIMA PERSIS an organization rooted in the academic environment - when it neglects to invest in the development of research capabilities. Moreover, this neglect undermines its self-proclaimed principle of "scientificity", thus calling into question the authenticity of its commitment to developing a rigorous academic culture. This disconnect between mission and action inhibits the potential for meaningful intellectual advancement within the organization, ultimately risking its long-term efficacy and relevance in an academic context (Caffentzis, 2005).

Returning to the problem at the beginning, namely the stigma and stereotype of the internal itself. This becomes a crucial aspect and crisis within Persis as a reform organization if conditions like this are allowed to continue. The mission of social transformation will never be achieved. The responsibility of Persis is considered a failure because it cannot accommodate the development of quality cadres, in this context Persis cannot be the main partner in the development of intellectual cadres. This causes a negative psychological impact on HIMA PERSIS and its cadres (Barth, 1998).

Returning to the initial challenges that have been outlined, the stigma and stereotypes that extend to HIMA PERSIS are pervasive in Persis' internal dynamics. This internal struggle becomes a significant obstacle for Persis as a reform organization, especially if these issues are not addressed. The overarching goal of social transformation that Persis seeks to achieve can become increasingly elusive in such a situation. The organization bears a great responsibility to nurture capable cadres capable of driving meaningful change; however, failure to fulfill this task will undermine its credibility and overall effectiveness (Fowler, 2000). In this context, Persis risks not being recognized as a key partner in the development of intellectual leaders in society. This shortcoming may cause detrimental psychological effects to HIMA PERSIS and its members, instilling a sense of disillusionment and eroding their spirit. If the internal environment continues to be inhospitable and riddled with stereotypes, the potential for growth and development will be hampered, which will ultimately hinder the reform goals championed by Persis. Overcoming this internal crisis is therefore crucial to the success of the organization and its future role in society.

Persis as the parent of this organization (ANAS et al., 2015) should ideally be the main partner of HIMA PERSIS in establishing collaboration and synergy in building cadre militancy instead tends to deconstruct rather than reconstruct. Assistance and support, appreciation for the steps and mission of HIMA PERSIS have been lost. Instead, the narrative that appears on the surface is a narrative of sentiment rather than constructive criticism and real action, especially in building militant cadres with their characteristics as intellectuals with high spirituality. Persis as the parent organization has an important role in fostering HIMA PERSIS by fostering collaboration and creating a synergistic environment aimed at developing strong cadres of militancy. Ideally, this partnership should focus on strategic guidance and resource allocation to strengthen HIMA PERSIS initiatives. However, instead of actively rebuilding and

empowering these efforts, it seems that Persis is currently dismantling the framework that could support Hima Persis' mission.

The decline in support for Hima Persis' activities is concerning, as it reflects a shift away from constructive engagement. The dialogue surrounding their initiatives has become increasingly sentimental, lacking the necessary critical analysis and actionable feedback that could facilitate meaningful progress. This trend is particularly worrying when considering the need for militants who not only possess intellectual rigor but also have a deep spirituality. A renewed focus on constructive criticism and proactive strategies is essential to rekindle enthusiasm for Hima Persis' mission and re-grow a community dedicated to the development of capable and enlightened individuals (Nguyen Huy, 2005). Without this change, the potential to develop impactful militant cadres may continue to diminish, ultimately hindering the broader goals of HIMA PERSIS and its parent organization, Persis.

To foster a dynamic research culture, the targeted activities can be integrated into the HIMA PERSIS regeneration program at the "Kabah", "Makkah", and "Madinah" levels (Persis & Nomor, 2020). This program not only aims to significantly increase the number of HIMA PERSIS cadres, but also to improve their quality. A key indicator of this quality is the rigorous assessment of the written work. The program will begin with a fundamental requirement: each participant will be tasked to write a research paper that not only reflects their personal insights but also serves as a foundation for deeper academic exploration. In addition, the curriculum at every level must undergo a comprehensive revitalization; it must evolve from simple material delivery and routine discussion to a framework that prioritizes research. This approach will encourage critical thinking and innovation, equipping participants with the essential skills to make meaningful contributions to their respective fields.

5. Conclusion

HIMA PERSIS stands as a significant Muslim student organization in Indonesia, positioned at the intersection of campus life and Islamic da'wah activities. Its strategic role encompasses not only the spread of Islamic values within academic settings but also the development of scientific thinking that aligns with religious principles. The organization faces both internal and external challenges, including organizational coordination issues, resource limitations, and the need to navigate an evolving social-political landscape while maintaining its core Islamic values. The concept of ulul albab within its scientific framework remains a work in progress, requiring careful development to bridge the gap between religious knowledge and academic disciplines.

To address these challenges and fulfill its potential as an agent of social change, HIMA PERSIS must focus on strengthening both internal and external collaborations. This includes developing stronger partnerships with other Islamic organizations, academic institutions, and community leaders, while also improving coordination between its various chapters across universities. The organization needs to implement structured leadership training programs, enhance its research capabilities, and create sustainable programs that benefit both students and society. By focusing on these aspects, HIMA PERSIS can better position itself to influence positive change in Indonesian society while maintaining its Islamic principles and academic integrity.

References

- Al-Faruqi, I. R. (2012). *Islam Religion, Practice, Culture & World Order*. International Institute of Islamic Thought (IIIT).
- Al-Faruqi, I. R. (2013). *The Essence of Islamic Civilization (Occasional Papers Series-21)*. International Institute of Islamic Thought (IIIT).
- Algazi, G. (2014). Comparing Medieval Institutions: A Few Introductory Remarks. In *Diverging Paths?* (pp. 1–15). Brill.
- ANAS, D. R. H. D. W., HUM, M., RAHMAN, D. R. M. T., & AWALUDIN, L. (2015). *Persatuan Islam*.
- Barth, F. (1998). *Ethnic groups and boundaries: The social organization of culture difference*. Waveland Press.
- Caffentzis, G. (2005). Immeasurable value? An essay on Marx's legacy. *The Commoner*, 10(21), 87–114.
- Davenport, T. H., & Prusak, L. (1998). *Working knowledge: How organizations manage what they know*. Harvard Business Press.

- Effendy, B., & Ali, F. (1986). Merambah Jalan Baru Islam. *Bandung: Mizan*.
- El Widdah, M. (2022). Madrasah Management Strategy as the Education Base for Religious Cadre. *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research*, 21(11), 227–242.
- Fauzan, P. I., Fata, A. K., & Basit, G. G. A. (2020). Pola Kaderisasi Gerakan Islam Puritan: Studi Kritis Atas Persatuan Islam. *Millah: Jurnal Studi Agama*.
- Foucault, M. (1982). The subject and power. *Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics/Harvester Wheatsheaf*.
- Fowler, A. (2000). *Civil society, NGOs and social development: Changing the rules of the game*. Geneva 2000 Occasional Paper.
- Gruenewald, D. A. (2004). A Foucauldian analysis of environmental education: Toward the socioecological challenge of the Earth Charter. *Curriculum Inquiry*, 34(1), 71–107.
- Humfress, C. (2014). Institutionalisation between theory and practice: comparative approaches to Medieval Islamic and Late Roman law. In *Diverging Paths?* (pp. 16–29). Brill.
- Jain, R. K., & Triandis, H. C. (1997). *Management of research and development organizations: managing the unmanageable* (Vol. 27). John Wiley & Sons.
- Murjazin, M., Nurhuda, A., Susanti, L., & Azami, Y. S. (2023). Psychological and Physiological Motives in Humans (Study on Verses of The Qur'an). *Suhuf*, 35(1), 19–25.
- Muttaqien, A. (2021). ULUL ALBAB SEBAGAI Pandangan Hidup Kader HIMA PERSIS (STUDI FENOMENOLOGI PEMAHAMAN KADER HIMA PERSIS/STAI PERSIS BANDUNG TERHADAP AYAT-AYAT ULUL ALBAB). *Jurnal Syntax Fusion*, 1(2), 126–138.
- Nguyen Huy, Q. (2005). An emotion-based view of strategic renewal. In *Strategy process* (pp. 3–37). Emerald Group Publishing Limited.
- Persis, P. P. H., & Nomor, U.-U. (2020). *Naskah 24 Tahun HIMA PERSIS(edisi Script)*.
- Poerbakawatja, S. (1982). *Ensiklopedi Pendidikan*, Cet. III, Jakarta: CV. Gunung Agung.
- Scott, W. R. (2008). *Institutions and organizations: Ideas and interests*. Sage.
- Setia, D. M. (2023). *Peran organisasi kemasyarakatan pemuda dalam sosialisasi politik Pemilu 2024: Studi deskriptif Pimpinan Wilayah HIMA PERSIS Jawa Barat*. UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung.
- Shediac-Rizkallah, M. C., & Bone, L. R. (1998). Planning for the sustainability of community-based health programs: conceptual frameworks and future directions for research, practice and policy. *Health Education Research*, 13(1), 87–108.
- Usman, A. (2021). Revitalisasi Gerakan Pembaruan Persatuan Persis (Persis). *Mukaddimah: Jurnal Studi Islam*.
- Whitley, R. (2000). *The intellectual and social organization of the sciences*. Oxford University Press, USA.
- Willmott, H. (1993). Strength is ignorance; slavery is freedom: Managing culture in modern organizations. *Journal of Management Studies*, 30(4), 515–552